Sharpening the Focus on Social Equity for Strategic Budget Decisions
Why We Focus on Racial Equity in Strategic Budget Decisions

June 11, 2020
Who am I?

Gordon F. Goodwin
GARE Director
20” Objectives:

• Explain GARE
• Increase awareness of government’s role in creating racial inequity
• Clarify what racial equity is, and...
• ....the role government can play in dismantling it
Government Alliance on Race and Equity

A national network of government working to achieve racial equity and advance opportunities for all.

✓ Launched as a member network in 2016 (12 members)
✓ Membership network of 200 members (and growing!)
✓ Member working groups include public works, criminal justice and policing, human resources, procurement / purchasing, and many more.
The Role of Government
Values and realities

- All men are created equal
- With liberty and justice for all
- Government of the people, by the people, for the people, shall not perish from the earth
History of government and race

Initially explicit

Government explicitly creates and maintains racial inequity.

Became implicit

Discrimination illegal, but “race-neutral” policies and practices perpetuate inequity.

Government for racial equity

Proactive policies, practices and procedures that advance racial equity.
Current Context

2010: Majority of new births are people of color

2030: Majority of people age 20-34 are people of color

2042: Majority of all Americans are people of color

Population

People of Color

White
Current Context: COVID-19
Why GARE leads with race

• Racial inequities deep and pervasive
• Racial anxiety on the rise – race is often an elephant in the room
• Specificity matters!
When Leading with Race, we are...

...Race *explicit*, _not exclusive_

Race _and_...

- ....gender
- ....sexual orientation
- ....religion
- ....disability status
- ....educational attainment
Racial inequity in the U.S.

From infant mortality to life expectancy, race predicts how well you will do...
WHAT IS RACIAL EQUITY?

Racial equity is realized when race can no longer be used to predict life outcomes, and outcomes for all groups are improved.
Achieving racial equity requires us to...

...Target strategies to focus improvements for those worse off

...Move beyond service provision to focus on changing policies, institutions and structures
DE&I - NOT a single concept
Fiscal Year 2021
Budget Equity Tool

Office of Equity
Zan Gibbs, Chief Equity Officer and
Jonathan Butler, Equity Manager
City of San Antonio

www.sanantonio.gov/Equity
Office of Equity

A Citywide Office whose purpose is to:

• **Normalize** concepts of social justice within city government;
• **Organize** staff around advancing equity in their Departments, and
• **Operationalize** equitable policies, programs and procedures within city government.
Equity Defined

Equity means that our policy-making, service delivery, and distribution of resources account for the different histories, challenges, and needs of the people we serve.

Equity is achieved when one’s identity cannot predict one’s outcomes.
Citywide Equity Strategies

Citywide Equity Committee, Train the Trainer, Department Equity Assessments and Equity Action Plans, Tools and Technical Assistance such as the Budget Equity Tool

Operationalizing equity throughout the City of San Antonio to get to results
Citywide Equity Committee

Cross Departmental

Identifies Opportunities and Challenges

Designs and Coordinate Equity Tools

Acts as Equity Representatives in Departments and
Informs Leadership Decisions and Policies

50 Staff Representing Every City Department
Our tools provide targeted strategies to help Departments focus on improving outcomes for those who are worse off, and move beyond just service delivery towards changing policies, institutions and structures to see measurable change in community indicators.

We use the operating framework from the Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE) and the principles of Results Based Accountability (RBA).

Closing the gaps so that race and income do not predict one’s success, while also improving outcomes for all
The tool is a critical thinking exercise that helps analyze how Departments are accounting for impacts on marginalized communities, as well as being a communication tool that helps the City articulate how Departments are integrating equity into budgeting. The tool serves as a structured way to apply equity to decision-making processes around resource allocation, and formalize an approach to operationalize equity within the City government’s existing processes.
Budget Equity Tool Format

A set of 10 questions intended to guide City Departments in assessing how their budgets could potentially benefit and/or burden our most marginalized communities. Commitments are made for the upcoming fiscal year.

Embedded in the tool is an overview, equity highlights from the previous year and a glossary.

Strengths and opportunities from every response are provided to the City Manager to help inform policy and strategic citywide direction.
1. In what ways will your overall (entire) budget be realigned for the next fiscal year in targeted ways to advance equity?

2. What are the recurring funding gaps or limitations in your overall budget that could inhibit your Department’s ability to advance racial and economic equity?

3. Identify potential impacts of your proposed reductions or fee changes (if applicable) on communities of color and low-income communities, and describe what strategies your Department recommends to mitigate any potential adverse impacts.
4. Indicate the racial and/or economic inequities experienced by San Antonio residents that could be addressed via specific allocations in the Department’s overall budget and improvement requests.

5. Within your proposed budget, describe ways in which disaggregated racial and economic data was used to prioritize and develop criteria for resource distribution.

6. What additional disaggregated demographic data will your Department collect, track, and evaluate to assess equity impacts and inform your future budget decisions?

7. How will your Department use disaggregated racial demographic data to help inform recruitment, retention, and promotion efforts for staff of color, including entry level, part-time, and field staff?
8. How will your proposed budget build the Department’s capacity to engage with, and include communities of color and low-income communities? What are the anticipated positive equity outcomes of these allocations?

9. How will your Department allocate funding towards ensuring that public documents, policies, plans, meetings, and hearings are readily accessible to the public? What are the anticipated equity impacts of this allocation?

10. How will community members, including communities of color and low-income communities, be consulted to identify programming and/or service needs, and how is this reflected in the proposed budget?
Budget Equity Tool Completion + Review Process

Departments Citywide Equity Committee members complete the new tool in collaboration with the Office of Equity, who orients leadership to the tool with an initial orientation meeting.

The Office of Equity provides ongoing technical assistance during the review period, and draft the responses together.

The final completed tools are due to the Budget Office at the same time as their annual budget submittals. The City Manager receives a high level overview of the responses, including strengths and weaknesses.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Report Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Racial Equity Indicator Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Poverty Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>LGBTQIA+ San Antonio Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Health Equity Report Card</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Accountability and Results

Technical assistance with a focus on structural change

The Budget Equity Tool process was changed to support better planning of funding allocations and improve the development of staff equity skills

Strengths/Weaknesses/Opportunities/Threats are identified for leadership to help create enhanced accountability towards progress

Focus Areas for Disparity Reduction:

1. Health Outcomes
2. Housing Stability
3. Economic Development
Operationalizing Equity Throughout the Process

Prioritizing funds for the most marginalized through the application of an equity matrix, including $50 million in housing relief funds.

Rapid response and long-term recovery efforts with an equity lens.

COVID-19 Equity Framework and Tool
Our goals are that equity practices, principles and procedures are embedded in the Departments, and that their equity efforts are funded.

We use data informed decision making strategies to ensure the best possible outcomes for communities of color and low-income communities.
Thank You
Zan Gibbs and Jonathan Butler

Zan.Gibbs@sanantonio.gov
Jonathan.Butler@sanantonio.gov
Prioritizing Social Equity
Strategic Budget Decisions

Fiscal Health Forecasting and Scenario Planning
Mid-Year Budget Adjustments
Long-term Recovery and Transformation

June 11th 2020
Still Need to Figure Out How to Fund These

Expenses ↑

Expenses ↑

Revenues ↓
Policy
Objectives, Intentions

Programming
Execution

Resources
Fuel

Where do you want to go?

How will you get there?

What (resources) do you need to accomplish the mission?
Where do you want to go?

Define the Objective
A systemic endeavor, resulting in equitable opportunities and outcomes where race/ethnicity can no longer be used to predict life outcomes, and outcomes for all groups are improved.
Engagement of communities of color rooted in anti-racist strategies and principles.

Anti-racist investment in creating and building economic opportunity and access for communities of color.

Anti-racist strategies and investment in building and growing household stability, access, safety, and/or health of communities of color.
Get Clear About Action

Programming
Execution

How will you get there?
PROGRAM:

Impound Lot

OPPORTUNITY TO INCREASE EQUITY:

Reconsider (and forgive) fines that stand in the way of economic opportunity
PROGRAM:
Pre-trial

OPPORTUNITY TO INCREASE EQUITY:
Reduce overnight stays in detention center by rapidly assessing cases at in-take prior to trial
PROGRAM:

Snow Removal

OPPORTUNITY TO INCREASE EQUITY:

Prioritize walkable pathways to bus stops (economic access), grocery stores, city services (libraries, parks, etc)

Prioritize walkable pathways to bus stops (economic access), grocery stores, city services (libraries, parks, etc)
How to Prioritize Resources

What (resources) do you need to accomplish the mission?
Still Need to Figure Out How to Fund These

Expenses ▲

Expenses ▲

Revenues ▼
We have new needs to launch new programs to tackle emerging challenges. To enhance current programs that need additional resources.

**Blueprint for Action**

**To Fund the Future**

**It’s 3-5 years down the road.....**

1.) What programs/services, among those you offer today, are going to need to grow?

2.) What programs will need to undergo some sort of transformation in the way you deliver them?

3.) What new programs will you need to launch?

**What future are you trying to prepare for?**

### Free-up & Re-allocate Resources
- Sourcing
- Efficiencies
- Service Levels

### Generate New Revenue
- Fees, Charges
- In-sourcing
- Grant Funding
- Taxes, Rates

- Can we leverage partners, or source services with public/private providers, in order to free up our resources?
- Focus on the “irreducible core”
- Can we apply technology to automate or free up human resources?
- Can we augment service delivery with volunteers?
- For programs less aligned with Results, can we reduce service levels, and free up resources? Or, can we eliminate services to free resources?

- Do our fees cover the costs of providing the service?
- Can we in-source, or provide any services regionally for a fee?

- Are we reporting the true cost of services to granting agency?
- Can we recoup additional funding, or attain new grant opportunities?

- Last resort
- Do we have no options left besides raising additional revenue from tax and rate payers?
The same exercise is appropriate whether you’re planning for 3-5 years down the road, or 3-5 months down the road...

What lenses would you apply for the insight you’re looking for?
The PBB Blue Print is our framework for telling the story of trade-off decisions.

We have new needs...
- ...to launch new programs to tackle emerging challenges
- ...to enhance current programs that need additional resources
- ...to preserve current services with growing expenses

We have no new needs...
- Preserve, maintain current services

### New Need – Increase Investment:
**Service Level Increase**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019 (Adopted)</th>
<th>2019 (Estimated)</th>
<th>2020 (Proposed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personnel</td>
<td>$281,628</td>
<td>$281,628</td>
<td>$292,893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-personnel</td>
<td>$146,500</td>
<td>$146,500</td>
<td>$147,965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Program</td>
<td>$428,128</td>
<td>$428,128</td>
<td>$440,858</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Resource Reallocation:
**Program Efficiency**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019 (Adopted)</th>
<th>2019 (Estimated)</th>
<th>2020 (Proposed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personnel</td>
<td>$92,607</td>
<td>$75,193</td>
<td>$78,201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-personnel</td>
<td>$32,737</td>
<td>$23,737</td>
<td>$26,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Program</td>
<td>$125,344</td>
<td>$98,930</td>
<td>$104,211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Who is ultimately the audience?

Why is it we’re doing this?

Within Your Department

Enhance ability to analyze and communicate:
- where your resources are currently invested (at a program by program level),
- the impact of your programs
- where future investments are needed, and why (impact on equity, DOI)
- where those resources might come from (new revenue generation and repurposing)

Citywide Perspective

- Create actionable insight to deal with a changing world, new needs and limited resources
- Provide a consistent platform for assessing a program’s performance through both an equity lens and the three pillars of the Denver Opportunity Index
- Identify opportunities for collaboration to increase impact and optimize resources

Program Inventory

Basic Program Attributes

Impact on Equity, DOI

Program’s Future Direction

Line-item (resource) data

Program’s Future Line Item
Creating new data unlocks unique insight
- Fundamental business intelligence to manage a 21st Century government
- Every program offered, how much it costs to provide it, cost recovery, population served, demand, degree of mandate, options to share, etc.
- Provide a consistent platform for accessing a program’s performance through both an equity lens and the three pillars of the Denver Opportunity Index

Insights lead to options for innovation
- Entrepreneurially, what are your options to generate new revenue through regional in-sourcing, cost recovery, grants, philanthropy, fees and charges?
- Opportunistically, where can we free up and repurpose resources through efficiencies, leveraging partner organizations (internally and externally)?

Actionable ideas move the City forward
- Amass resources to invest in new programs that need to be launched, and current programs that need to be enhanced
- Execute on revenue generation ideas and resource reallocation initiatives
- Fund the future you’re trying to create...
Importance of Programmatic Data

Where is our best opportunity for savings?

Efficiency
- Trend: If work-from-home opportunities increase, perhaps we can temporarily save and reallocate

Service Level Increase
- City work spaces may need to be even more sanitary, increasing demand

Regional In-sourcing
- Is there an opportunity to expand services to regional partners?

Custodial Cleaning Services

Description: Clean sanitize and restock products at city facilities
Total Cost: 150,457.2
FTE: 2.63

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Cost</th>
<th>Positions</th>
<th>Operating Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Cost: 150,457</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NonPersonnel (30.54%)
Personnel (69.46%)

Dismiss
Maximizing Program Insights

MUNICIPAL OPERATING BUDGET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Blueprint Comment Assigned</th>
<th>Comment Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increase Revenues - Fees or Charges</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase Revenues - In-sourcing or Grant Funding</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repurpose Resources - Decrease Service levels</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repurpose Resources - Outsource or Partner</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repurpose Resources - Program Efficiency</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Level Increase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
City of St. Albert
Overview of Programmatic Opportunities

- **Within Next 6 Months**: $200,000
- **Within 6-12 Months**: $750,000
- **Within 12-18 Months**: $2,750,000
- **Beyond 18-24 Months**: $1,850,000
- **Beyond 24+ Months**: $1,950,000

Most Promising Opportunities for 2020 Revenue Shortfall

- **Total: $4.5M**
- **Total: $6.8M**

Can We Ramp Implementation? Adjacently Possible Options

- **Goal: $7M**
- **Total: $11.3M**

Program Insight Workshop:
CRASH COURSE
Creating and Applying Programmatic Business Intelligence
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Service Type</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>ProgNum</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capital Budget Development</td>
<td>Stewardship of development of annual capital budget for Municipal and Utility operations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capital Planning</td>
<td>Planning and preparation of all City capital projects. This is done in conjunction with other City departments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Cemetery Management</td>
<td>Responding to clients’ cemetery needs, requests, complaints and inquiries about cemetery standards, fees and appointments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Committee Meetings</td>
<td>Attending Council Committee Meetings and other activities related to Council Committees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community Environment Programs</td>
<td>Partners in Parks, Neighbourhood and Schoolyard clean up and Community naturalization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community Events</td>
<td>The coordination and delivery of arts, cultural, community development, environment, emergency services, recreation and parks events, utilizing a combination of City and volunteer resources to expose the community to events, create a connected community, increase community well-being and create a destination for residents and visitors. The service also includes support provided by the provision of community events by other internal departments, including PublicWorks &amp; Transit, Emergency Services, Community Services, Engineering and Strategic Services and IT.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Showing 1 to 25 of 152 entries
Program Costing

CRASH COURSE
Creating and Applying Programmatic Business Intelligence

Program Inventory - Update program inventory.
Program Costing - Complete program cost allocation.
Program Scores - Complete program scoring.
Present PBB - Visualize the outcomes of PBB.
Resource Alignment - Study your program costs.
Reports - Download a Program Manual, Export raw data.

Line-item (resource) data
Scoring / Evaluation

Program Inventory - Update program inventory.
Program Costing - Complete program cost allocations.
Program Scores - Complete program scoring.

Present PBB - Visualize the outcomes of PBB.
Resource Alignment - Study your program costs.
Reports - Download a Program Manual, Export raw data.

Impact on Outcomes
Basic Program Attributes
Line-item (resource) data
Program Inventory

CRASH COURSE
Creating and Applying Programmatic Business Intelligence
**Program Summary - Business Attraction**

**Program Description:** Activities that attract new industrial and commercial business to St. Albert. Services include 1-on-1 meetings with businesses, developers, and real estate agents. Commercial Realtor Tour, and attending trade shows and conferences to promote St. Albert as a place to do business.

## Basic Program Attributes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demand</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>(d) Demand is increasing annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(e) is required by City policy, administrative directive, or bylaw (Please provide the policy, directive, or bylaw in the comments. This does not apply to Master Plans or Business Plans.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PopServed</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>(f) Less than 10% of residents use the program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RecoveryCost</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>(g) The City must incur the full cost of providing this program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relience</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>(h) Program could be delivered by another agency, private business or through a partnership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Program’s Result Scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ResultAbbr</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Growth and Resiliency</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Economic Growth and Resiliency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks, Recreation and Culture</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Parks, Recreation and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe and Secure Community</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Safe and Secure Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Environment</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Natural Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Wellbeing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Community Wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure Transportation</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Infrastructure and Transportation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Blueprint for Action
To Fund the Future

It's 3-5 years down the road.....
1) What programs/services, among those you offer today, are going to need to grow?
2) What programs will need to undergo some sort of transformation in the way you deliver them?
3) What new programs will you need to launch?

What future are you trying to prepare for?

- Can we leverage partners, or source services with public/private providers, in order to free up our resources?
- Focus on the "irreducible core"
- Can we apply technology to automate or free up human resources?
- Can we augment service delivery with volunteers?
- For programs less aligned with Results, can we reduce service levels, and free up resources? Or, can we eliminate services to free resources?
- Do our fees cover the costs of providing the service?
- Can we in-source, or provide any services regionally for a fee?
- Are we reporting the true cost of services to grant agencies?
- Can we recoup additional funding, or attain new grant opportunities?
- Last resort
- Do we have no options left besides raising additional revenue from tax and rate payers?
City of South Jordan, Utah
2016-2019 (current)

We have new needs…
- to launch new programs
to tackle emerging challenges
- to enhance current programs that need additional resources

Free-up & Re-allocate Resources

Generate New Revenue

Sourcing
- Can we in-source, or provide any services regionally for a fee?
- Do our fees cover the costs of providing the service?
- Are we reporting the true cost of services to granting agency?
- Can we recoup additional funding, or attain new grant opportunities?
- Can we leverage partners, or source services with public/private providers, in order to free up our resources?

Efficiencies
- Can we apply technology to automate or free up human resources?
- Can we augment service delivery with volunteers?
- Can we augment service delivery with volunteers?

Service Levels
- Can we reduce service levels, and free up resources? Or, can we eliminate services to free resources?

Fees, Charges
- Do we have no options left besides raising additional revenue from tax and rate payers?

In-sourcing
- Can we in-source, or provide any services regionally for a fee?
- Can we in-source, or provide any services regionally for a fee?

Grant Funding
- Do our fees cover the costs of providing the service?
- Are we reporting the true cost of services to granting agency?
- Can we recoup additional funding, or attain new grant opportunities?

Taxes, Rates
- Do we have no options left besides raising additional revenue from tax and rate payers?

Increased investment in service level increases and new programs
- $10.2 million
- 18%

$2.6 million
- 11% from Resource Re-allocation

$1.7 million
- 3% freed up

$1.5 million
- 3% freed up

$3.5 million
- 6% new revenue

$711,607
- 1% tax revenue

$0.3 million
- 7% from New Revenue

$0.5 million
- 5% freed up

$0.4 million
- 3% freed up

City of South Jordan, Utah
2016-2019 (current)
Q&A